



City Hall, 215 Sycamore St.
Muscatine, IA 52761-3899
(563) 264-1550
Fax (563) 264-0750

FINANCE & RECORDS

MEMO

To: Gregg Mandsager, City Administrator

From: Melanie Alexander, Art Center Director
Nancy A. Lueck, Finance Director
Randy Hill

Date: April 5, 2016

Re: Resolution to Award Bid for Art Center HVAC Project

Introduction:

As a result of an Energy Conservation Study for the Muscatine Art Center/Museum (December 2013), the City entered into an agreement with A & J Associates to design upgrades at the Art Center that would increase overall energy efficiency and create an environment that has the stable humidity levels necessary for storage of moisture sensitive pieces of art and other artifacts.

Background:

A public hearing was held on the project on March 3 and the bid opening for the Art Center HVAC and Window Replacement project was set for March 24, 2016. One bid was received from the Crawford Company. The bid proposal form included the base bid and four items labeled as Alternates. The minimum amount of work on the project, however, requires the base bid and allowance for "antique" electrical outlets which totaled \$1,252,870, Alternate #1 for the specified control system for \$202,250, and Alternate #3 for the geothermal heat exchanger for \$135,400. The base bid and these alternates total to \$1,590,520.

The 2016 bond issue includes \$1,375,000 for HVAC and window replacement and the Art Center received a grant from the Roy J. Carver Charitable Trust to cover an additional \$200,000 for the HVAC project, bringing the currently available funding to \$1,575,000.

The proposed minimum amount of work (\$1,590,520), along with A & J Associates' fee of 9% for work accepted and 7.2% for work not accepted, totals \$1,744,255. Boring completed by A-One Geothermal in summer 2015 for \$9,900 raises the amount to \$1,754,146. Taking into

"I remember Muscatine for its sunsets. I have never seen any on either side of the ocean that equaled them" — Mark Twain

consideration additional “soft costs”, the minimum project cost is over the currently available funding by \$200,000.

The Board of Trustees of the Muscatine Art Center held a special meeting with a presentation by Vic Amoroso of A & J Associates on March 31, 2016. Understanding that an additional \$200,000 would be required to complete the minimum project, the board passed a motion to approve the bid from Crawford Company and committed to raising the required funds. The board anticipates that these funds will come from a combination of sources – Muscatine Art Center Trust Funds held by the City of Muscatine, private and corporate donations, and potentially a grant from the Muscatine Art Center Support Foundation.

The Board of Trustees also discussed Alternate #2 for work in the Carriage House (\$127,125) and Alternate #4 for the plaster repair in the pipe room (\$19,950) which total \$147,075. The contractor has agreed to hold their costs for these alternates until September 1, 2016. The board’s intent is to secure funds for these alternates, but a decision will not be made until fundraising opportunities are exhausted, fundraising goals are achieved, or the September 1st extension is reached.

Recommendation:

It is staff’s recommendation that the contract for the base bid and Alternates #1 and #3 be awarded to Crawford Company in the amount of \$1,590,250 and the additional amount for Alternates #2 and #4 be approved subject to the Art Center securing additional funding.

Please include this item on the agenda for the April 7, 2016 Council meeting. Please contact any of us if you have any questions or need additional information.

Attachments:

1. Copy of A & J Associates Recommendation
2. Bid Tab
3. Letter from Crawford Company
4. Resolution Awarding Initial Work

RESOLUTION NO. _____

**RESOLUTION AWARDED CONTRACT FOR THE
MUSCATINE ART CENTER/MUSEUM HVAC REPLACEMENT
AND WINDOW RENOVATIONS PROJECT**

WHEREAS, bids were received on March 24, 2016 for the Muscatine Art Center/Museum HVAC Replacement and Window Renovations Project; and

WHEREAS, the bid submitted by Crawford Company of Rock Island, Illinois, is determined to be the lowest responsible bid for the project; and

WHEREAS, due to funding availability, the city is initially awarding the base bid, electrical allowance, and Alternates #1 and #3 for a total of \$1,590,520; and

WHEREAS, the contractor has agreed to hold the costs for Alternates #2 and #4 until September 1, 2016, subject to the Art Center securing funding for the additional costs for these alternates.

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED that the base bid and Alternates #1 and #3 be awarded to the Crawford Company in the amount of \$1,590,520 and the Mayor and City Clerk be authorized and directed to enter into a written contract with said contractor covering the furnishing of material for, and construction of the Muscatine Art Center/Museum HVAC Replacement and Window Renovations Project, such contract not to be binding until approved by resolution of this Council.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED that the amount of the contractor's bond is fixed at \$1,590,520, which is 100% of the contract price and that contract Alternates #2 and #4 will also be awarded to the Crawford Company if the Art Center Board of Trustees is successful in securing funding for these costs.

PASSED, APPROVED, AND ADOPTED THIS 7TH DAY OF APRIL, 2016.

Diana L. Broderson, Mayor

ATTEST:

Gregg Mandsager, City Administrator



A&J Associates
Mechanical and Electrical Consulting Engineers

March 28, 2016

Melanie Alexander
Muscatine Museum of Art
1314 Mulberry Avenue
Muscatine, IA 52761

Randy Hill
City of Muscatine
1459 Washington St.
Muscatine, Iowa 52761

Re: Bids Received
Muscatine Art Center HVAC Replacement & Miscellaneous Window Renovations
A&J #201310.01

Dear Melanie and Randy:

On Thursday, March 24, 2016, the City of Muscatine received one bid for the Muscatine Art Center HVAC Replacement & Miscellaneous Window Renovations project. Crawford Company submitted the sole bid.

Woodruff Companies tried to submit a bid after the 10:00 AM bid receipt closing time. Their delivered late bid was not accepted.

The bid breakdown as indicated in the attached Tabulation of Bids. Crawford Co. is the low and only bidder regardless of which combination of base bid and alternates are selected.

Refer to the attached spread sheet which indicated seven possible project scope scenarios. Project costs and subsequent design fees are listed.

The bid proposal form included an Allowance #1, informational Alternates #1 and #3, and discretionary Alternates #2A, #2B, #2C and #4.

Allowance #1 was included to cover the amount of unknown electrical work to rewire outlets and light fixtures in the Musser House. The exact amount of rework cannot be determined without some destructive examination such as removing trim and opening plaster walls. No destructive examination was done during the design phase.

Informational alternates need to be taken to provide a "complete" project. The informational alternates were requested to indicate the actual costs of specialty items of controls and the horizontal bore geothermal loop field.

Discretionary alternates were listed as opportunities for the Art Center to reduce scope and cost of the overall project, if available funds so dictated. Discretionary alternates do not have to be exercised to complete the primary scope of the project.

365 Beaver Kreck Centre, Suite B North Liberty, IA 52317
Phone (319) 626-4719 Fax (319) 626-4941

Scope scenarios are described as follows.

- A. Scope Scenario 1 includes the following work.
 - 1. Base Bid heating system work without controls or geothermal heat exchange.
 - 2. Allowance #1 for \$15,000 for electrical work.
 - 3. Alternate #1 for controls for Base Bid heating system work. Control alternate was listed as an informational alternate.
 - 4. Alternate #3 for the Geothermal Heat Exchanger Alternate was listed as an informational alternate.
- B. Scope Scenario 2 includes the following work.
 - 1. Scope Scenario 1 work.
 - 2. Alternate #4 work which includes plaster repair in the Organ Pipe Room.
- C. Scope Scenario 3 includes the following work.
 - 1. Scope Scenario 1 work.
 - 2. Alternate #2A work which includes Carriage House Windows.
- D. Scope Scenario 4 includes the following work.
 - 1. Scope Scenario 3 work.
 - 2. Alternate #4 work which includes plaster repair in the Organ Pipe Room.
- E. Scope Scenario 5 includes the following work.
 - 1. Scope Scenario 1 work.
 - 2. Alternate #2B which includes Carriage House HVAC system.
 - 3. Alternate #2C which includes Carriage House HVAC controls.
- F. Scope Scenario 6 includes the following work.
 - 1. Scope Scenario 1 work.
 - 2. Alternates #2B which includes the Carriage House HVAC.
 - 3. Alternate #2C which Includes the Carriage House Controls.
 - 4. Alternate #4 which includes Plaster Repair in the Organ Pipe Room.
- G. Scope Scenario 7 includes the following work.
 - 1. Base Bid Work.
 - 2. Allowance #1
 - 3. All Alternates #1, #2A, #2B, #2C, #3 and #4.

The minimum amount of work that should be completed is the work defined under Scope Scenario 1 or the sum of the Base Bid, Allowance #1 and informational Alternates #1 and #3 for \$1,590,520.

We discussed the bid submitted by Crawford Co. with Scott Stubblefield and Dan Fisher. Scott felt comfortable with his bid and had no concerns about the project schedule and phasing as



long as equipment delivery times indicated by equipment suppliers were honored. Scott also felt comfortable with the overall completeness of his bid.

There were no exceptions, clarifications or irregularities indicated in Crawford Co.'s submitted bid, except Crawford did not fill out "Glass and Aluminum Frame" Contractor information. Crawford will have to use one of the subcontractors listed in the specifications in any event.

The selection of which scope scenario depends on how much money is available for the project.

A&J recommends awarding a contract to Crawford Co. for Base Bid and all Alternate work in the amount of \$1,737,595 for the following reasons if the funds are available at this time.

1. Overall bids were within A&J's estimate range for the different scenarios, so bids were at the amounts A&J expected.
2. Completing all the work included with all the Alternates allows the Art Center to complete the overall upgrade of the HVAC and replace failed windows under one project so as to minimize the disruption of the Museum and Art Center Operations.
3. There is no guarantee that delaying any part of the work described under discretionary alternates would result in lower costs than represented by the Alternate bids received from Crawford.
4. Scott Stubblefield will be the project manager for Crawford. Scott was the project manager for JL Brady when they did the Musser House Boiler replacement. He is familiar with the Musser House heating system.

Please let me know if you have any questions or comments. I will be at the City Council meeting to explain the bid received and our recommendations to do all of the work specified.

Sincerely,
A&J Associates


Victor Amoroso

Enclosure



TABULATION OF BIDS



348 B EAYER KREEK
CENTRE, SUITE B
NORTH LIBERTY, IA 52117
(319) 626-4719 voice
(319) 626-4941 fax

PROJECT NAME: City of Muscatine Art Center HVAC Replacement & Miscellaneous Window Renovations

A&J PROJ. NO.: 201810.01

PAGE 1 OF 1

DATE OF BID 03/24/2018

NAME AND LOCATION OF BIDDER	A&J's Estimate Range - to +20%	20%	Crawford Company Iowa	Dubuquo.			
ADDENDUM No. 1			Yes				
ADDENDUM No. 2			Yes				
BASE BID	\$1,187,040 to \$1,795,500		\$1,237,870.00				
ALLOWANCE #1	\$15,000		\$15,000.00				
BASE BID + ALLOWANCE #1	\$1,212,040 to \$1,810,500		\$1,252,870.00				
ALTERNATE #1	\$84,000 to \$126,000		\$202,350.00				
ALTERNATE #2A	\$23,804 to \$35,706		\$45,650.00				
ALTERNATE #2B	\$98,735 to \$148,100		\$61,675.00				
ALTERNATE #2C	\$32,000 to \$48,000		\$19,000.00				
ALTERNATE #3	\$83,360 to \$125,040		\$135,400.00				
ALTERNATE #4	\$17,920 to \$26,880		\$19,950.00				
BIDDER STATUS FORM			Yes; complete				
BID BOND			5%				
MECHANICAL SUBCONTRACTOR			Crawford Company				
SECTION 15031 SUBCONTRACTOR			A-Ono Geothermal				
ELECTRICAL SUBCONTRACTOR			Bickle Electric				
CONTROL SUBCONTRACTOR			Woodman Controls				
TESTING AND BALANCING SUBCONTRACTOR			Fisher Test & Balance				
GLASS AND ALUMINUM FRAME SUBCONTRACTOR			NOT LISTED				
HISTORIC WOOD WINDOWS SUBCONTRACTOR			Iowa City Window & Door				



"The Comfort Company"

Prepared by: Scott Stubblefield

Crawford Company
1306 Mill Street
Rock Island, IL 61201
Phone: 309-788-4573
Fax: 309-788-4691

April 1, 2016

Project Directory

Project Name: Muscatine Art Museum HVAC Upgrade and Window Replacement – 201310.01
1314 Mulberry Ave
Muscatine, IA

Engineer Name: A&J Associates
365 Beaver Kreek Centre Suite B
North Liberty, IA 52317
(319) 626-4719

Contractor: Crawford Company – Scott Stubblefield
1306 Mill Street
Rock Island, IL 61281
(309) 788-4573

Crawford Company hereby notifies the above Engineer that the prices for alternates listed as 2A, 2B, and 2C on our bid read publicly for the above mentioned project will be extended through September 1st 2016. These alternates may be added to the project anytime up until this date without any price adjustment. This includes the complete alternates listed above and their scope entirely.

Regards
Scott Stubblefield
Estimator

"Providing Leadership Quality Service for the HVAC/R and Plumbing Industry"