



Stanley Consultants INC

A Stanley Group Company
Engineering, Environmental and Construction Services - Worldwide

April 8, 2015

Mr. Randy Hill
Muscatine Public Works
1459 Washington Street
Muscatine, IA 52761

Dear Randy:

Subject: Letter of Recommendation (Updated)
West Hill Area Sanitary and Storm Sewer Separation – Phase 3
Muscatine, Iowa

This letter provides you with our report on the results of the bid opening, which was held in the Muscatine City Lower Conference Room, at 10:00 a.m., on March 19, 2015, and offers our recommendation for award of contract.

Enclosed is a copy of Bid Tabulation Sheet No. 17660.30.00. Three (3) bids were received. The base bid ranged from a low total extended price of \$4,988,668.00 to a high of \$5,743,819.00. The alternate bids ranged from a low total extended price of \$1,227,312.00 to a high of \$2,124,425.50. The total bid, base plus alternate, ranged from \$6,494,811.00 to \$7,868,244.50. The low bid was submitted by Hagerty Earthworks, LLC., Muscatine, Iowa.

All bids were responsive to the bid documents. An arithmetic check of all unit and extended prices were made and several errors were found. The total price listed in this letter reflects the correction of those errors. The arithmetic errors did not change the low bid order of the bidders. Also enclosed please find the bid summary that details the breakdown of the bids on a sub-phase basis.

All bidders submitted the proper bid security, acknowledged receipt and understanding of Addenda Nos. 1, and 2, and are considered to be qualified Sanitary and Storm Sewer Contractors. The Engineer's total estimated cost for the bid form base bid quantities was \$6,270,770.63. Muscatine Power and Water (MP&W) estimated the alternate bid at \$1,000,000. The enclosed bid summary also lists the estimated construction costs of the sewer and paving work at \$5,932,424.00.

MP&W has reviewed the alternate bid information and has rejected the alternate bid. See attached email documenting MP&W decision.

We recommend award of this contract, base bid, to Hagerty Earthworks, LLC., Muscatine, Iowa in the total amount of \$4,988,668.00.

We will retain all bids until after City Council approval at which time all bids will be given to the City and bid bonds will be returned to the bidders.

This document was sent electronically

If you have any questions, please feel free to call.

Sincerely,

Stanley Consultants, Inc.

Handwritten signature of Karmen K. Heim in black ink.

Karmen K. Heim
Project Engineer

Enclosure(s): Bid Tabulation Sheet No. 17660.30.00
West Hill Phase 3 - Bid Summary
April 7, 2015 Email

cc: John Hagerty, Hagerty Earthworks

Project Files 17660.30

K:\H:\mp\2\MUS-PW1\DS-1\Doc\F:17660:17660.30.04:City:20150408_L_Hill_Recommendation.doc

**WEST HILL AREA - SANITARY AND STORM SEWER SEPARATION - PHASE 3, MUSCATINE, IA
 BID SUMMARY**

West Hill Phase 3 Totals	Sub Phase	Engineering Estimate (BASED ON BID QUANTITIES)	Hagerly Earthworks	Langman Construction	Miller Trucking and Excavating
Base Bid	A	\$ 1,726,939.99	\$ 1,362,319.30	\$ 1,503,791.78	\$ 1,620,730.00
	B	\$ 2,025,742.35	\$ 1,645,093.60	\$ 1,771,921.12	\$ 1,870,373.00
	C	\$ 2,518,088.29	\$ 1,981,255.10	\$ 2,235,988.37	\$ 2,252,716.00
Base Bid Total		\$ 6,270,770.63	\$ 4,988,668.00	\$ 5,511,701.27	\$ 5,743,819.00
Alternate Bid	A		\$ 344,341.00	\$ 286,116.00	\$ 493,794.00
	B		\$ 335,536.00	\$ 268,201.00	\$ 501,325.50
	C		\$ 826,266.00	\$ 672,995.00	\$ 1,129,306.00
Alternate Bid Total		\$ 1,000,000.00	\$ 1,506,143.00	\$ 1,227,312.00	\$ 2,124,425.50
Total, Base Plus Alternate	A		\$ 1,706,660.30	\$ 1,789,907.78	\$ 2,114,524.00
	B		\$ 1,980,629.60	\$ 2,040,122.12	\$ 2,371,698.50
	C		\$ 2,807,521.10	\$ 2,908,983.37	\$ 3,382,022.00
GRAND TOTAL, BASE PLUS ALTERNATE		\$ 7,270,770.63	\$ 6,494,811.00	\$ 6,739,013.27	\$ 7,868,244.50

Yellow highlight indicates calculated totals that are different than totals printed on bid submittals

PRINTED TOTALS AS LISTED ON SUBMITTED UNIT PRICE SCHEDULE, PAGE 16 REV 1

West Hill Phase 3 Totals	Sub Phase	Engineering Estimate	Hagerly	Langman	Miller
Base Bid	A	\$ 1,726,939.99	\$ 1,362,319.30	\$ 1,503,791.78	\$ 1,620,530.00
	B	\$ 2,025,742.35	\$ 1,645,093.60	\$ 1,771,921.12	\$ 1,870,373.00
	C	\$ 2,518,088.29	\$ 1,959,053.10	\$ 2,235,988.37	\$ 2,252,766.00
Base Bid Total		\$ 6,270,770.63	\$ 4,966,466.00	\$ 5,511,701.27	\$ 5,743,669.00
Alternate Bid	A		\$ 344,341.00	\$ 286,116.00	\$ 493,794.00
	B		\$ 335,536.00	\$ 268,201.00	\$ 501,325.50
	C		\$ 826,266.00	\$ 672,995.00	\$ 1,129,306.00
Alternate Bid Total		\$ 1,000,000.00	\$ 1,506,145.00	\$ 1,227,312.00	\$ 2,124,425.50
Total, Base Plus Alternate	A		\$ 1,706,660.30	\$ 1,789,907.78	\$ 2,114,324.00
	B		\$ 1,980,629.60	\$ 2,040,122.12	\$ 2,371,698.50
	C		\$ 2,785,321.10	\$ 2,908,983.37	\$ 3,382,072.00
GRAND TOTAL, BASE PLUS ALTERNATE		\$ 7,270,770.63	\$ 6,472,611.00	\$ 6,739,013.27	\$ 7,868,094.50

Stanley Consultants, Opinion of Probable Construction Cost based on Sewer and Pavement Work *		
Base Bid	A	\$ 1,628,608.00
	B	\$ 1,944,489.00
	C	\$ 2,359,327.00
Base Bid Total		\$ 5,932,424.00

* Includes Addendum 1 and Addendum 2 Revisions.
 Accounts for Select Backfill (Z) and Fill Site Grading and Compaction (JJ) for Sewer Work Only

Heim, Karmen

From: Hill, Randy <rhill@muscatinelowa.gov>
Sent: Tuesday, April 07, 2015 5:09 PM
To: Gregg Mandsager
Cc: William Haag; Steve Dalbey; Jim Edgmond; Heim, Karmen; Connie Mann; Fran Donelson
Subject: MPW - West Hill Phase III

All --- MPW has rejected the alternate bid from Hagerty for the water main work as part of the West Hill Phase III project. We will go to council Thursday night with a resolution Awarding the Contract to Hagerty Earthworks for the Sewer portion only. rhill

RESOLUTION NO. _____

AWARD CONTRACT FOR

**WEST HILL SANITARY AND STORM SEWER
SEPARATION PROJECT – PHASE 3**

It is resolved that the following bid is determined to be the lowest responsible bid for the West Hill Sanitary and Storm Sewer Separation Project – Phase 3.

<u>NAME & ADDRESS CONTRACTOR</u>	<u>AMOUNT OF BID</u>
Hagerty Earthworks, LLC Muscatine, IA	\$4,988,668.00

It is further resolved that the West Hill Sanitary and Storm Sewer Separation Project – Phase 3 is awarded to the above named contractor for \$4,988,688.00, and the Mayor and City Clerk are authorized and directed to enter into a written contract with said contractor covering the furnishing of material for, and construction of the West Hill Sanitary and Storm Sewer Separation Project – Phase 3, such contract not to be binding until approved by resolution of this Council.

It is further resolved that the amount of the contractor’s bond is fixed at \$4,988,688.00, which is one hundred percent of the contract price.

PASSED, APPROVED, AND ADOPTED THIS 9th DAY OF APRIL, 2015.

DeWayne M. Hopkins, Mayor

ATTEST:

Gregg Mandsager, City Administrator